128 studiosi avvertono: “Non incastrate le Nazioni Unite in una definizione di antisemitismo vaga e utilizzata come arma”

3 novembre 2022 – Euobserver

In qualità di studiosi specializzati in antisemitismo, studi sull’olocausto, storia ebraica moderna e campi correlati, assistiamo con crescente preoccupazione a sforzi motivati politicamente per strumentalizzare la lotta contro l’antisemitismo all’interno e contro le Nazioni Unite.

L’ambasciatore israeliano alle Nazioni Unite Gilad Erdan ha guidato questi sforzi. Nei suoi persistenti tentativi di indebolire i palestinesi e di proteggere il governo israeliano dalle critiche internazionali Erdan è arrivato al punto di denunciare l’agenzia delle Nazioni Unite per i rifugiati palestinesi (UNRWA) e la Corte penale internazionale (ICC) come “antisemite”.

Al di là di tale diffamazione, il Sig. Erdan ora cerca di cambiare radicalmente le regole del gioco spingendo l’ONU ad adottare la “Definizione operativa di antisemitismo” dell’International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA WDA).

Troviamo questa definizione profondamente problematica. Vaga e incoerente, l’IHRA WDA non soddisfa i requisiti di base di una buona definizione.

Piuttosto che garantire una maggiore chiarezza, l’IHRA WDA ha generato confusione su ciò che costituisce antisemitismo.

Di conseguenza, l’IHRA WDA è diventata molto controversa e contestata, anche tra gli ebrei. Le sue debolezze hanno spinto 350 eminenti studiosi di antisemitismo, studi sull’Olocausto e campi

correlati ad approvare un'altra definizione più solida, la Dichiarazione di Gerusalemme sull'antisemitismo.

L'effetto divisivo e polarizzante dell'IHRA WDA deriva da undici "esempi contemporanei di antisemitismo" ad essa allegati, sette dei quali riguardano Israele. Ampie prove mostrano che questi esempi vengono utilizzati come armi per screditare e mettere a tacere come antisemitismo le legittime critiche alle politiche di Israele.

Tra coloro che denunciano tale uso improprio c'è Kenneth Stern, l'autore principale dell'IHRA WDA. Più recentemente, Antony Lerman, ex capo dell'Institute of Jewish Affairs del World Jewish Congress, ha aspramente criticato l'IHRA WDA per diversi difetti, inclusa la sua attenzione nei riguardi del cosiddetto "nuovo antisemitismo" legato a Israele, a scapito dell'attenzione verso forme virulente di antisemitismo ora in aumento.

Uno degli esempi dell'IHRA WDA dice: "Applicare doppi standard richiedendo a [Israele] un comportamento non previsto o richiesto da parte di nessun'altra nazione democratica". Questo esempio è particolarmente soggetto ad abusi politici in seno alle Nazioni Unite, poiché può essere facilmente invocato per etichettare come antisemita qualsiasi risoluzione delle Nazioni Unite che critichi Israele.

Cerchiamo di essere chiari: accogliamo con tutto il cuore l'impegno delle Nazioni Unite a combattere l'antisemitismo e lodiamo l'ONU per i suoi fondamentali sforzi in questa direzione. Ciò a cui ci opponiamo e contro cui mettiamo fortemente in guardia è che le Nazioni Unite possano mettere a repentaglio questa lotta essenziale e danneggiare la propria missione universale di promuovere i diritti umani approvando una definizione che costituisce uno strumento politico per scoraggiare la libertà di parola e per proteggere il governo israeliano dalla responsabilità delle sue azioni.

Sappiamo che l'IHRA WDA è stata adottata da più governi, principalmente in Europa e negli Stati Uniti. Questo è di per sé problematico. Tuttavia, se le Nazioni Unite approvassero l'IHRA

WDA, il danno sarebbe esponenzialmente maggiore.

Il governo israeliano sarebbe incoraggiato e abilitato a intensificare la sua campagna contro gli organismi e gli esperti delle Nazioni Unite, usando come un'arma e sfruttando l'IHRA WDA come standard delle Nazioni Unite per "stabilire" che l'UNRWA, la CPI, il Consiglio per i diritti umani e organismi come la Commissione d'inchiesta sono antisemiti.

Inoltre i difensori dei diritti umani e le organizzazioni che contestano le violazioni israeliane sarebbero completamente esposti a campagne diffamatorie basate su accuse in malafede di antisemitismo, danneggiando la loro libertà di espressione e altri diritti fondamentali protetti e promossi dalle Nazioni Unite.

La missione e il mandato delle Nazioni Unite si basano su un serio dibattito sulle preoccupazioni relative ai diritti umani. L'adozione dell'IHRA WDA trasformerebbe qualsiasi discussione fattuale sulle violazioni e responsabilità israeliane in un aspro dibattito sulla presunzione di antisemitismo

Ciò potrebbe anche indebolire la capacità delle Nazioni Unite di agire come mediatore neutrale in Israele e Palestina. Le debolezze e la strumentalizzazione dell'IHRA WDA hanno implicazioni dirette per la capacità delle Nazioni Unite di combattere l'antisemitismo e tutte le altre forme di razzismo su basi universali. L'alto rappresentante delle Nazioni Unite Miguel Moratinos è stato incaricato dalle Nazioni Unite di sviluppare una "risposta rafforzata a livello di sistema [all'antisemitismo] basata su un approccio ai diritti umani".

Oltre a contraddire un approccio basato sui diritti umani [universali, ndt], l'IHRA WDA inevitabilmente politicizzerebbe quella risposta e quindi comprometterebbe la capacità delle Nazioni Unite di combattere efficacemente l'antisemitismo.

Invece di identificarsi formalmente con una definizione vaga e divisiva che è stata distorta per proteggere il governo israeliano, l'ONU dovrebbe rafforzare la sua lotta contro l'antisemitismo

basandosi sui suoi principi universali sui diritti umani, in conformità con la sua Carta.

Nella ricerca di un orientamento l'ONU dovrebbe essere libera diconsultare una varietà di risorse, inclusa la Dichiarazione di Gerusalemme sull'antisemitismo. Diamo il benvenuto al recente rapporto del Prof. E. Tendayi Achiume, relatore speciale delle Nazioni Unite sulle forme contemporanee di razzismo, in cui "mette in guardia contro la dipendenza dall'IHRA WDA come strumento guida per e presso l'ONU e le sue entità costituenti" e invita "gli Stati membri delle Nazioni Unite e i suoi funzionari [a] rifiutare fermamente e agire in modo responsabile per porre fine alla strumentalizzazione politica della lotta contro l'antisemitismo".

Esortiamo gli Stati membri delle Nazioni Unite e i suoi funzionari ad agire in base all'avvertimento del Relatore speciale Achiume e a invitare e tenersi pronti a sostenere le Nazioni Unite nei loro passi avanti.

Elenco delle firme [Data la non perfetta corrispondenza tra i titoli accademici italiani e quelli anglosassoni si è preferito lasciare l'elenco in originale, ndt]

Meir Amor, Dr., Department of Sociology and Anthropology (retired), Concordia University, Montreal

Ofer Ashkenazi, Professor, Director The Richard Koebner Minerva Center for German History, The

Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Aleida Assmann, Professor of English Literature and Cultural Theory, Konstanz University

Jan Assmann, Professor, Egyptologist and Religious Studies, University of Heidelberg

Leora Auslander, Arthur and Joann Rasmussen Professor of Western Civilization in the College and

Professor of European Social History, Department of History, University of Chicago

Angelika Bammer, Professor of Comparative Literature, Affiliate Faculty of Jewish Studies, Emory

University

Omer Bartov, Samuel Pisar Professor of Holocaust and Genocide Studies, Department of History,

Faculty Fellow, Watson Institute for International & Public Affairs, Brown University

Moshe Behar, Dr., Arabic & Middle Eastern Studies, School of Arts, Languages & Cultures, The

University of Manchester

Peter Beinart, Professor of Journalism and Political Science, The City University of New York (CUNY);

Editor at large, Jewish Currents

Joel Beinin, Donald J. McLachlan Professor of History and Professor of Middle East History, Emeritus,

Stanford University

Elissa Bemporad, Jerry and William Ungar Chair in East European Jewish History and the Holocaust;

Professor of History, Queens College and The City University of New York (CUNY)

Doris Bergen, Chancellor Rose and Ray Wolfe Professor of Holocaust Studies, Department of History

and Anne Tanenbaum Centre for Jewish Studies, University of Toronto

Werner Bergmann, Professor Emeritus Dr., Sociologist, Center for

Research on Antisemitism,

Technische Universität Berlin

Michael Berkowitz, Professor of Modern Jewish History, Department of Hebrew & Jewish Studies,

University College London

Lila Corwin Berman, Murray Friedman Chair of American Jewish History, Temple University

David Biale, Emanuel Ringelblum Distinguished Professor Emeritus, UC Davis

Frank Biess, Professor of Modern European History, University of California-San Diego

Daniel Blatman , Professor Emeritus, Department of Jewish History and Contemporary Jewry, The

Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Donald Bloxham, Richard Pares Professor of History, University of Edinburgh

Daniel Boyarin, Taubman Professor of Talmudic Culture Emeritus, UC Berkeley

Micha Brumlik, Professor Dr., fmr. Director of Fritz Bauer Institut-Geschichte und Wirkung des

Holocaust, Frankfurt am Main

Jose Brunner, Professor Emeritus, Buchmann Faculty of Law and Cohn Institute for the History and

Philosophy of Science, Tel Aviv University

Bryan Cheyette, Professor and Chair in Modern Literature and Culture, University of Reading

Geoffrey Claussen, Associate Professor of Religious Studies, Lori and Eric Sklut Scholar in Jewish

Studies and Chair of the Department of Religious Studies, Elon University

Stephen Clingman, Distinguished University Professor, Department of English, University of

Massachusetts, Amherst

Raya Cohen, Dr., fmr. lecturer Department of Jewish History, Tel Aviv University and Department of

Sociology, University of Naples Federico II

Alon Confino, Pen Tishkach Chair of Holocaust Studies, Professor of History and Jewish Studies,

Director Institute for Holocaust, Genocide, and Memory Studies, University of Massachusetts,

Amherst

Sebastian Conrad, Professor of Global and Postcolonial History, Freie Universität Berlin

Frank Dabba Smith, Rabbi Dr., Leo Baeck College

Sidra DeKoven Ezrahi, Professor Emerita of Comparative Literature, The Hebrew University of

Jerusalem

Hasia R. Diner, Professor Emerita, New York University

Monique Eckmann, Professor Emerita, University of Applied Sciences and Arts, Western Switzerland

(HES-SO), Geneva; fmr. member Swiss delegation to the IHRA (2004-2018)

Vincent Engel, Professor, University of Louvain, UCLouvain

Jennifer Evans, Professor, Department of History, Carleton University; Member College of New

Scholars, Royal Society of Canada

David Feldman, Professor of History, Director of the Birkbeck Institute for the Study of Antisemitism,

University of London

Anna Foa, fmr. Associate Professor, Department of History, Cultures, Religions, Sapienza University

of Rome

Ute Frevert, Director of the Max Planck Institute for Human Development, Berlin

Efrat Gal-Ed, Professor Dr., Institute of Jewish Studies, Heinrich Heine University Düsseldorf

Katharina Galor, Hirschfeld Senior Lecturer in Judaic Studies, Brown University

Alexandra Garbarini, Charles R. Keller Professor of History, Faculty Affiliate in Jewish Studies,

Williams College

Sander Gilman, Distinguished Professor of the Liberal Arts and Sciences Emeritus, Emory University

Shai Ginsburg, Associate Professor, Chair of the Department of Asian and Middle Eastern Studies and

Faculty Member of the Center for Jewish Studies, Duke University

Amos Goldberg, Professor, The Jonah M. Machover Chair in Holocaust Studies, Head of the Avraham

Harman Research Institute of Contemporary Jewry, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Harvey Goldberg, Professor Emeritus, Department of Sociology and Anthropology, The Hebrew

University of Jerusalem

Sylvie-Anne Goldberg, Professor, Jewish Culture and History, Head of Jewish Studies at the Advanced

School of Social Sciences (EHESS), Paris

Svenja Goltermann, Professor Dr., Historisches Seminar, University of Zurich

Dorota Glowacka, Professor, Humanities, University of King's College, Halifax

Leonard Grob, Professor Emeritus of Philosophy, Fairleigh Dickinson University

Jeffrey Grossman, Associate Professor and Chair Germanic Languages and Literatures, Member

Program in Jewish Studies, University of Virginia

Atina Grossmann, Professor of History, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, The Cooper Union,

New York

Wolf Gruner, Shapell-Guerin Chair in Jewish Studies, Professor of History and Founding Director of

the USC Dornsife Center for Advanced Genocide Research, University of Southern California

Ruth HaCohen, Artur Rubinstein Professor Emerita of Musicology, The Hebrew University of

Jerusalem

Aaron J. Hahn Tapper, Professor, Mae and Benjamin Swig Chair in Jewish Studies, Director of the

Swig Program in Jewish Studies and Social Justice, University of San Francisco

Anna Hajkova, Associate Professor of Modern Continental European History, Warwick University

Rachel Havrelock, Professor of English and Jewish Studies, University of Illinois, Chicago

Elizabeth Heineman, Professor of History and of Gender, Women's and Sexuality Studies, University

of Iowa

Deborah Hertz, Wouk Chair in Modern Jewish Studies, University of California, San Diego

Dagmar Herzog, Distinguished Professor of History and Daniel Rose Faculty Scholar Graduate Center,

The City University of New York (CUNY)

Dafna Hirsch, Dr., Department of Sociology, Political Science and Communication, The Open

University of Israel

Marianne Hirschberg, Professor, Faculty of Human Sciences, University of Kassel

Jill Jacobs, Rabbi, Executive Director, T'ruah: The Rabbinic Call for Human Rights, New York

Uffa Jensen, Professor Dr., Center for Research on Antisemitism, Technische Universität, Berlin

Jonathan Judaken, Professor, Spence L. Wilson Chair in the Humanities, Rhodes College

Irene Kacandes, The Dartmouth Professor of German Studies and Comparative Literature,

Dartmouth University

Marion Kaplan, Professor Emerita of Hebrew and Judaic Studies, New York University

Brian Klug, Hon. Fellow in Social Philosophy, Campion Hall, University of Oxford; Emeritus Fellow,

Faculty of Philosophy, University of Oxford; Hon. Fellow, Parkes Institute for the Study of Jewish/nonJewish Relations, University of Southampton

Thomas A. Kohut, Sue and Edgar Wachenheim III Professor of History, Williams College

Alexander Korb, Dr., Associate Professor in Modern European History, Stanley Burton Centre for

Holocaust and Genocide Studies, University of Leicester

Tony Kushner, Professor, Parkes Institute for the Study of Jewish/non-Jewish Relations, University of

Southampton

Dominick LaCapra, Professor Emeritus of History, Cornell University

Ferenc Laczó, Assistant Professor in European History, Maastricht University

Ben Lapp, Associate Professor of History, Montclair State University, New Jersey

Nitzan Lebovic, Professor, Department of History, Chair of Holocaust Studies and Ethical Values,

Lehigh University

Claudia Lenz, Professor of Social Science, Chair for prevention of racism and antisemitism, MF

Norwegian School of Theology, Religion and Society, Oslo

Mark Levene, Dr., Emeritus Fellow, University of Southampton and Parkes Centre for Jewish/nonJewish Relations

Giovanni Levi, Professor Emeritus of Modern History, Ca' Foscari University of Venice

Simon Levis Sullam, Associate Professor of Modern History, Ca' Foscari University of Venice

Hanno Loewy, Director of the Jewish Museum Hohenems, Austria

Ian S. Lustick, Bess W. Heyman Chair Emeritus, Department of Political Science, University of

Pennsylvania

Sergio Luzzatto, Emiliana Pasca Noether Chair in Modern Italian History, Department of History,

University of Connecticut

Shaul Magid, Professor of Jewish Studies, Dartmouth College

Avishai Margalit, Professor Emeritus in Philosophy, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Jessica Marglin, Associate Professor of Religion, Law and History, Ruth Ziegler Early Career Chair in

Jewish Studies, University of Southern California

David Mednicoff, Associate Professor of Middle Eastern Studies and Public Policy and Chair

Department of Judaic and Near Eastern Studies, University of Massachusetts, Amherst

Eva Menasse, Novelist, Berlin

Paul Mendes-Flohr, Professor Emeritus of History and Religious Thought, University of Chicago;

Professor Emeritus at the Divinity School, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Leslie Morris, Professor of German and Jewish Studies, Chair Department of German, Nordic, Slavic &

Dutch, University of Minnesota

Dirk Moses, Professor, Anne & Bernard Spitzer Chair in International Relations, The City College of

New York (CCNY)

Samuel Moyn, Henry R. Luce Professor of Jurisprudence and Professor of History, Yale University

Harriet L. Murav, Professor, Center for Advanced Study, Catherine and Bruce Bastian Professor of

Global and Transnational Studies, Department of Slavic Languages and Literatures, Comparative and

World Literature, University of Illinois

Susan Neiman, Professor Dr., Philosopher, Director of the Einstein Forum, Potsdam

Adi Ophir, Professor Emeritus, Tel Aviv University; Visiting Professor, Brown University, the Cogut

Institute for the Humanities and the Center for Middle East Studies

Atalia Omer, Professor of Religion, Conflict and Peace Studies at the University of Notre Dame and

the Dunphy Visiting Professor of Religion, Violence, and Peacebuilding at Harvard Divinity School

Thomas Pegelow Kaplan, Professor of History, Louis P. Singer Endowed Chair in Jewish History,

University of Colorado Boulder

Robert Jan van Pelt, University Professor, School of Architecture, University of Waterloo

Derek Penslar, William Lee Frost Professor of Jewish History, Harvard University

Andrea Pető, Professor, Central European University (CEU), Vienna; CEU Democracy Institute,

Budapest

Alessandro Portelli, fmr. Professor of Anglo-American Literature, Sapienza University of Rome

David Ranan, Dr., Political Scientist and Writer, London/Berlin

James Renton, Professor of History, Co-Director, International Centre on Racism, Edge Hill University

Na'ama Rokem, Associate Professor, Director Joyce Z. And Jacob Greenberg Center for Jewish

Studies, University of Chicago

Mark Roseman, Distinguished Professor in History, Pat M. Glazer Chair in Jewish Studies, Indiana

University

Göran Rosenberg, Writer and Journalist, Sweden

Ishay Rosen-Zvi, Professor of Talmud and Jewish Philosophy, Department of Jewish Philosophy, Tel

Aviv University

Michael Rothberg, 1939 Society Samuel Goetz Chair in Holocaust

Studies, UCLA

Raz Segal, Associate Professor of Holocaust and Genocide Studies and Endowed Professor in the

Study of Modern Genocide, Stockton

Joshua Shanes, Professor and Director of the Arnold Center for Israel Studies, College of Charleston

David Shulman, Professor Emeritus, Department of Asian Studies, The Hebrew University of

Jerusalem

Dmitry Shumsky, Professor, Israel Goldstein Chair in the History of Zionism and the New Yishuv,

Head of the Institute of History, Department of Jewish History and Contemporary Jewry, The Hebrew

University of Jerusalem

Tamir Sorek, Liberal Arts Professor of Middle East History and Jewish Studies, Penn State University

David Sorkin, Lucy G. Moses Professor of Modern Jewish History, Department of History, Yale

University

Stefanie Schüler-Springorum, Professor Dr., Director of the Center for Research on Antisemitism,

Technische Universität Berlin

Michael Stanislawski, Nathan J. Miller Professor of Jewish History, Department of History, Columbia

University

Michael P. Steinberg, Barnaby Conrad and Mary Critchfield

Keeney Professor of History; Professor of

Music and German Studies, Brown University

Lior Sternfeld, Associate Professor of History and Jewish Studies, Penn State University

Mira Sucharov, Professor and Associate Chair, Department of Political Science, Carleton University

Kylie Thomas, Dr., Senior Researcher, NIOD Institute for War, Holocaust and Genocide Studies,

Amsterdam

Anya Topolski, Associate Professor of Ethics and Political Philosophy, Radboud University, Nijmegen

Barry Trachtenberg, Associate Professor, Rubin Presidential Chair of Jewish History, Wake Forest

University

Enzo Traverso, Susan and Barton Winokur Professor in the Humanities, Department of History,

Cornell University, Ithaca, New York

Peter Ullrich, Dr. Dr., Senior Researcher, Fellow at the Center for Research on Antisemitism,

Technische Universität Berlin

Alana M. Vincent, Associate Professor, Religious Studies, Department of Historical, Philosophical and

Religious Studies, Umeå University

Anika Walke, Georgie W. Lewis Career Development Professor and Associate Professor of History,

Washington University in St. Louis

Dov Waxman, The Rosalinde and Arthur Gilbert Foundation Chair in Israel Studies, University of

California Los Angeles (UCLA)

Sebastian Wogenstein, Associate Professor of German, Hebrew and Judaic Studies, University of

Connecticut

Moshe Zimmermann, Professor Emeritus, The Richard Koebner Minerva Center for German History,

The Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Steven J. Zipperstein, Daniel E. Koshland Professor in Jewish Culture and History, Stanford University

Moshe Zuckermann, Professor Emeritus of History and Philosophy, Tel Aviv University

(traduzione dall'inglese di Giuseppe Ponsetti)